## RESEARCH REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE

1. Report No. UND 2011-01	2 Damant Data 2 Cante	a at Nia		Project No.	
	2. Report Date 3. Contract No. Nov 2011			4. Project No.	
5. Title and Subtitle		6. Report	Type	7. Project No.	
			n link to open report	,,	
Evaluation of the Rut Resistance F	Performance of Warm Mix Asphalts	in	to open repert	8. Project No.	
North Dakota		Work	Plan □		
		Constr	_	9. Project No.	
		Evalua		40. Pario et No	
		Final		10. Project No.	
		<u>- 11101</u>			
11. Author(s)/Principle Investigator(s)  Dr. Nobil Sulpimon					
Dr. Nabil Suleiman  12. Performing Organization Name and Addre	nee	1	13. Sponsoring Agency Name and A	ddraee	
_					
	Department of Civil Engineering University of North Dakota		North Dakota DOT		
NDDOT OTHER*			Materials and Research Division		
NDSU	Grand Forks, ND 58202		300 Airport Road		
UND 🖂			Bismarck ND 58504-6005		
UGPTI					
OTHER*					
*see supplementary notes					
14. Supplementary Notes					
1. Abstract					
1. Abstract					
Purpose and Need					
The North Dakota Department of T					
additive The primary purpose of t					
				nder dry and wet conditions using the	
asphalt pavement analyzer. The fig	eld specimens' rut resistance evalu	ations will give	e insights into the usefulness	of the using warm mixes in North	
Dakota.					
Objective and Scope					
wijedii to diid dadho					
The main objective and scope of this proposed study are:					
To evaluate the rut resistance of North Dakota's WMA field samples as well as HMA control samples from a trial section near Valley City,					
				from a trial section near Valley City,	
North Dakota using the	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry	and wet cond	litions.		
North Dakota using the • To assess the performa	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry nce of the WMA specimens by con	and wet cond nparing their r	litions.	from a trial section near Valley City, ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance	
North Dakota using the • To assess the performa	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry	and wet cond nparing their r	litions.		
<ul> <li>North Dakota using the</li> <li>To assess the performa results for both dry and</li> </ul>	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry nce of the WMA specimens by con	and wet cond nparing their r	litions.		
North Dakota using the To assess the performa results for both dry and  Summary	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry nce of the WMA specimens by con wet (moisture resistance) condition	and wet cond nparing their r s.	litions. ut resistance results to the co	ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance	
North Dakota using the To assess the performa results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious a	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry nce of the WMA specimens by con wet (moisture resistance) condition about the use of WMA in North Dal	and wet cond nparing their r s. sota on a large	litions.  ut resistance results to the co  scale without further testing	ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance  Future tests may include additional	
North Dakota using the To assess the performa results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious and APA rut testing, other strength testing.	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry nce of the WMA specimens by con wet (moisture resistance) condition about the use of WMA in North Dal s, or field monitoring to make a de	and wet cond nparing their r s. cota on a large initive decisio	litions.  ut resistance results to the co  e scale without further testing n on the utility of warm mixes	ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance  Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to	
North Dakota using the To assess the performa results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious and APA rut testing, other strength testing.	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry nce of the WMA specimens by con wet (moisture resistance) condition about the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost,	and wet cond nparing their r s. cota on a large initive decisio	litions.  ut resistance results to the co  e scale without further testing n on the utility of warm mixes	ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance  Future tests may include additional	
North Dakota using the  To assess the performa results for both dry and  Summary  At this juncture, the PI is cautious and APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into color researching warm mixes in North II.	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry nce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) condition about the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.	and wet cond paring their r s. sota on a large initive decisio and realize re	ditions.  It resistance results to the contract to the contrac	ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance  Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to s are very strong incentives to continue	
North Dakota using the To assess the performa results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious a APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into color researching warm mixes in North II.  The APA results indicate that the V	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry nce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) condition about the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited hig	and wet cond paring their r s. sota on a large initive decisio and realize re	ditions.  In the contract of t	ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance  Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to s are very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the	
North Dakota using the To assess the performa results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious a APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into color researching warm mixes in North II  The APA results indicate that the Vaverage WMA rut values were 13	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry nce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) condition about the use of WMA in North Dal s, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited hig percent and 29 percent higher thar	and wet cond paring their r s. sota on a large initive decisio and realize re her rut values the average	ditions.  In the content of the cont	ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance  Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to s are very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the under dry and wet conditions,	
North Dakota using the To assess the performa results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious a APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into color researching warm mixes in North II The APA results indicate that the Vaverage WMA rut values were 13 respectively. Since the premise of	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry nce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) condition about the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited hig percent and 29 percent higher thar wet testing using the APA is done	and wet cond paring their r s. sota on a large initive decisio and realize re her rut values the average	ditions.  In the content of the cont	ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance  Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to s are very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the	
North Dakota using the To assess the performa results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious a APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into color researching warm mixes in North II  The APA results indicate that the Vaverage WMA rut values were 13	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry nce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) condition about the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited hig percent and 29 percent higher thar wet testing using the APA is done	and wet cond paring their r s. sota on a large initive decisio and realize re her rut values the average	ditions.  In the content of the cont	ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance  Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to s are very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the under dry and wet conditions,	
North Dakota using the To assess the performa results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious a APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into color researching warm mixes in North Day The APA results indicate that the Vaverage WMA rut values were 13 respectively. Since the premise of earlier fears of reduced durability values.	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry nce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) condition about the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited hig percent and 29 percent higher than wet testing using the APA is done when using the warm mixes.	and wet conditions and realize results to somewhat to somewhat to somewhat the average and realize to somewhat the average and realize to somewhat the average and realize the average and realize the somewhat the	ditions.  In the content of the cont	ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance  Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to sare very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the under dry and wet conditions, mance, this research results confirm the	
North Dakota using the To assess the performa results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious a APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into coloresearching warm mixes in North II  The APA results indicate that the Vaverage WMA rut values were 13 prespectively. Since the premise of earlier fears of reduced durability values are the premise of the APA rut results show that 5 spectrum.	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry nce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) condition about the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited hig percent and 29 percent higher than wet testing using the APA is done when using the warm mixes.	and wet conditions and realize results to somewhat to somewhat the som	ditions.  In the color of the c	ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance  Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to sare very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the under dry and wet conditions, nance, this research results confirm the	
North Dakota using the To assess the performa results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious a APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into coloresearching warm mixes in North II  The APA results indicate that the Vaverage WMA rut values were 13 prespectively. Since the premise of earlier fears of reduced durability values close to the 9.0 mm criteria.	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for dry nce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) condition about the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited hig percent and 29 percent higher than wet testing using the APA is done when using the warm mixes.  Decimens out of the 32 have failed serion. Granting that the WMA failure.	and wet conditions and realize results to somewhat the 9.0 mm rue rates are high	ditions.  In tresistance results to the control of the scale without further testing in on the utility of warm mixes aductions in harmful emission in comparison with the HMA rut values of the HMA mixes at represent durability perform the criterion. Six out of the 7 Whith, one should be cautioned to	ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance  Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to sare very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the under dry and wet conditions, mance, this research results confirm the	
North Dakota using the To assess the performar results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious and APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into coloresearching warm mixes in North III.  The APA results indicate that the Waverage WMA rut values were 13 prespectively. Since the premise of earlier fears of reduced durability with the APA rut results show that 5 sprut values close to the 9.0 mm critesample size. To be able to come upon the strength of the premise of the sample size.	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for drynce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) conditionabout the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited highercent and 29 percent higher than wet testing using the APA is done when using the warm mixes.  Decimens out of the 32 have failed the prion. Granting that the WMA failure powith definitive conclusions, more	and wet conditions and wet conditions and realize results to somewhat the 9.0 mm rule rates are hig WMA sample	ditions.  Let resistance results to the content of the scale without further testing in on the utility of warm mixes eductions in harmful emission in comparison with the HMA rut values of the HMA mixes at represent durability performs to criterion. Six out of the 7 Whith, one should be cautioned to should be tested. Although	ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance  Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to sare very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the under dry and wet conditions, nance, this research results confirm the	
North Dakota using the To assess the performar results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious and APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into coloresearching warm mixes in North III.  The APA results indicate that the Waverage WMA rut values were 13 prespectively. Since the premise of earlier fears of reduced durability with the APA rut results show that 5 sprut values close to the 9.0 mm critesample size. To be able to come upon the strength of the premise of the sample size.	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for drynce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) conditionabout the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited highercent and 29 percent higher than wet testing using the APA is done when using the warm mixes.  Decimens out of the 32 have failed erion. Granting that the WMA failure with definitive conclusions, more between 8 and 9 mm. While there were wet the total conditions of the same	and wet conditions and wet conditions and realize results to somewhat the 9.0 mm rule rates are hig WMA sample	ditions.  Let resistance results to the content of the scale without further testing in on the utility of warm mixes eductions in harmful emission in comparison with the HMA rut values of the HMA mixes at represent durability performs to criterion. Six out of the 7 Whith, one should be cautioned to should be tested. Although	ntrol HMA specimens' rut resistance  Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to s are very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the under dry and wet conditions, mance, this research results confirm the MA specimens that did not fail exhibited nat those results are based on a small no HMA specimens failed the rut test,	
North Dakota using the To assess the performar results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious at APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into color researching warm mixes in North II.  The APA results indicate that the Vaverage WMA rut values were 13 prespectively. Since the premise of earlier fears of reduced durability with the APA rut results show that 5 sprut values close to the 9.0 mm crite sample size. To be able to come unearly half of them had rut values were mainly on	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for drynce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) conditionabout the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited highercent and 29 percent higher than wet testing using the APA is done when using the warm mixes.  Decimens out of the 32 have failed the perion. Granting that the WMA failure poetween 8 and 9 mm. While there we the low side.	and wet conditions and wet conditions and realize results to somewhat the 9.0 mm rule rates are hig WMA sample	ditions.  Let resistance results to the content of the scale without further testing in on the utility of warm mixes eductions in harmful emission in comparison with the HMA rut values of the HMA mixes at represent durability performs to criterion. Six out of the 7 Whith, one should be cautioned to should be tested. Although	Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to s are very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the under dry and wet conditions, mance, this research results confirm the MA specimens that did not fail exhibited that those results are based on a small no HMA specimens failed the rut test, and air voids and the rut values, the air	
North Dakota using the  To assess the performar results for both dry and  Summary  At this juncture, the PI is cautious at APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into coloresearching warm mixes in North II.  The APA results indicate that the Waverage WMA rut values were 13 prespectively. Since the premise of earlier fears of reduced durability with the APA rut results show that 5 sprut values close to the 9.0 mm critic sample size. To be able to come unearly half of them had rut values of the sample size.	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for drynce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) conditionabout the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited hig percent and 29 percent higher than wet testing using the APA is done when using the warm mixes.  Decimens out of the 32 have failed erion. Granting that the WMA failure p with definitive conclusions, more between 8 and 9 mm. While there we the low side.	and wet conditions and realize residual to somewhat the average 15 to somewhat e rates are hig WMA sample was no specification and realize residual to somewhat a sample was no specifications.	e scale without further testing on on the utility of warm mixes ductions in harmful emission in comparison with the HMA rut values of the HMA mixes at represent durability perform the criterion. Six out of the 7 WM, one should be cautioned the should be tested. Although the trend between the calculate	Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to sare very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the under dry and wet conditions, mance, this research results confirm the MA specimens that did not fail exhibited nat those results are based on a small no HMA specimens failed the rut test, and air voids and the rut values, the air	
North Dakota using the To assess the performar results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious at APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into color researching warm mixes in North II.  The APA results indicate that the Vaverage WMA rut values were 13 prespectively. Since the premise of earlier fears of reduced durability with the APA rut results show that 5 sprut values close to the 9.0 mm crite sample size. To be able to come unearly half of them had rut values were mainly on	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for drynce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) conditionabout the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited highercent and 29 percent higher than wet testing using the APA is done when using the warm mixes.  Decimens out of the 32 have failed erion. Granting that the WMA failure point definitive conclusions, more between 8 and 9 mm. While there we the low side.	and wet conditions and realize residual to somewhat the average 15 to somewhat e rates are hig WMA sample was no specification and realize residual to somewhat a sample was no specifications.	e scale without further testing on on the utility of warm mixes ductions in harmful emission in comparison with the HMA rut values of the HMA mixes at represent durability perform the criterion. Six out of the 7 WM, one should be cautioned the should be tested. Although the trend between the calculate	Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to s are very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the under dry and wet conditions, mance, this research results confirm the MA specimens that did not fail exhibited that those results are based on a small no HMA specimens failed the rut test, and air voids and the rut values, the air	
North Dakota using the  To assess the performar results for both dry and  Summary  At this juncture, the PI is cautious at APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into coloresearching warm mixes in North II.  The APA results indicate that the Vaverage WMA rut values were 13 prespectively. Since the premise of earlier fears of reduced durability values close to the 9.0 mm critic sample size. To be able to come unearly half of them had rut values voids percentages were mainly on  16. Key Words  Asphalt Pavement	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for drynce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) conditionabout the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a del weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited hig percent and 29 percent higher than wet testing using the APA is done when using the warm mixes.  Decimens out of the 32 have failed erion. Granting that the WMA failure p with definitive conclusions, more between 8 and 9 mm. While there we the low side.	and wet conditions and realize residual to somewhat the average 15 to somewhat e rates are hig WMA sample was no specification and realize residual to somewhat a sample was no specifications.	e scale without further testing on on the utility of warm mixes ductions in harmful emission in comparison with the HMA rut values of the HMA mixes at represent durability perform the criterion. Six out of the 7 WM, one should be cautioned the should be tested. Although the trend between the calculate	Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to sare very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the under dry and wet conditions, mance, this research results confirm the MA specimens that did not fail exhibited nat those results are based on a small no HMA specimens failed the rut test, and air voids and the rut values, the air	
North Dakota using the  To assess the performar results for both dry and  Summary  At this juncture, the PI is cautious at APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into color researching warm mixes in North II.  The APA results indicate that the Vaverage WMA rut values were 13 prespectively. Since the premise of earlier fears of reduced durability vortices ample size. To be able to come unearly half of them had rut values voids percentages were mainly on  16. Key Words  Asphalt  Pavement  WMA	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for drynce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) conditionabout the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a delaweather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited highercent and 29 percent higher than wet testing using the APA is done when using the warm mixes.  Decimens out of the 32 have failed from Granting that the WMA failure power with definitive conclusions, more between 8 and 9 mm. While there we the low side.	and wet conditions and realize restrictions and realize restrictions and realize restrictions.  The average of the solution of	e scale without further testing on on the utility of warm mixes ductions in harmful emission in comparison with the HMA rut values of the HMA mixes at represent durability perform the criterion. Six out of the 7 WM, one should be cautioned the should be tested. Although the trend between the calculated able to the public by	Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to s are very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the under dry and wet conditions, nance, this research results confirm the MA specimens that did not fail exhibited nat those results are based on a small no HMA specimens failed the rut test, and air voids and the rut values, the air	
North Dakota using the  To assess the performar results for both dry and  Summary  At this juncture, the PI is cautious at APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into coloresearching warm mixes in North II.  The APA results indicate that the Vaverage WMA rut values were 13 prespectively. Since the premise of earlier fears of reduced durability values close to the 9.0 mm critic sample size. To be able to come unearly half of them had rut values voids percentages were mainly on  16. Key Words  Asphalt Pavement	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for drynce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) conditionabout the use of WMA in North Dals, or field monitoring to make a delawather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited highercent and 29 percent higher than wet testing using the APA is done when using the warm mixes.  Decimens out of the 32 have failed from Granting that the WMA failure power with definitive conclusions, more between 8 and 9 mm. While there we the low side.  17. Distribution Statement No restrictions. This docure clicking this link.	and wet conditions and realize restrictions are highly was no specifications.	e scale without further testing on on the utility of warm mixes ductions in harmful emission in comparison with the HMA rut values of the HMA mixes at represent durability perform the criterion. Six out of the 7 WM, one should be cautioned the should be tested. Although the trend between the calculated able to the public by	Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to sare very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the under dry and wet conditions, mance, this research results confirm the MA specimens that did not fail exhibited nat those results are based on a small no HMA specimens failed the rut test, and air voids and the rut values, the air	
North Dakota using the To assess the performare results for both dry and  Summary At this juncture, the PI is cautious a APA rut testing, other strength test extend the paving season into coloresearching warm mixes in North II The APA results indicate that the Vaverage WMA rut values were 13 prespectively. Since the premise of earlier fears of reduced durability values close to the 9.0 mm critesample size. To be able to come unearly half of them had rut values voids percentages were mainly on  16. Key Words  Asphalt Pavement WMA	Asphalt Pavement Analyzer for drynce of the WMA specimens by conwet (moisture resistance) condition about the use of WMA in North Dalis, or field monitoring to make a deli weather, see savings in fuel cost, Dakota.  WMA mixes generally exhibited highercent and 29 percent higher than wet testing using the APA is done when using the warm mixes.  Decimens out of the 32 have failed from Granting that the WMA failure provided by the low side.  17. Distribution Statement No restrictions. This docured is called the low side.  North Dakota Demander of the WMA failure of the low side.	and wet conditions and realize restrictions are highly was no specifications.	e scale without further testing on on the utility of warm mixes ductions in harmful emission in comparison with the HMA rut values of the HMA mixes at represent durability perform the criterion. Six out of the 7 WM, one should be cautioned the should be tested. Although the trend between the calculated able to the public by  Fransportation Division:	Future tests may include additional in North Dakota. The potential to s are very strong incentives to continue control specimens. As reported, the under dry and wet conditions, nance, this research results confirm the MA specimens that did not fail exhibited nat those results are based on a small no HMA specimens failed the rut test, and air voids and the rut values, the air	

Fax: (701) 328-6913

Office: (701) 323-6900